

CHAPTER – VI

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

Chapter - VI

Conclusion and Suggestions

The India-Pakistan Relations is one of the most complex bilateral relations in the world. Innumerable factors design to push these bilateral ties on the boiling pot. The nefarious colonial designs and weak internal political will invariably create problems in identifying simple solutions of the lingering issues. In historical perspective it is clear that India and Pakistan is the core states of South Asia which are culturally similar linguistically unite geographically closed and historically related. But it is strange that despite the geographical, historical and cultural similarity the relations between these two states not so much smooth and peaceful. The demand for Pakistan was itself based on distrust. Roots of this kind of relationship between India-Pakistan can be seen in the colonial history of Indian subcontinent. British colonial rules established a tradition by the partition of this subcontinent that creates a chain of struggles, disputes and instability in the region. Bilateral relations between India and Pakistan are undoubtedly the most important in South Asia and the world also. But relations among both states not at all smooth in nature and has been full of ups and downs. Now the both countries are overtly nuclear powered, they poses greater risk, if the ongoing crisis is not resolved. Difficulties in their relations arise mainly because their differences are not rooted in legal and constitutional interpretations and misunderstanding, but in geography, emotional legacies past history and their divergent views on the doctrine of two - nation theory. The leaders of the both the states are responsible for creating this kind of psyche, which cause the differences.

It has resulted from a number of complex factors like legacy, the difference in religion and race, conflicting national interests, ideologies, power struggle. From the very beginning, the two

powers became involved in a conflict ridden relationship over the status of the former princely - state of Jammu and Kashmir and forced immigrate of thousands of Hindu and Muslim into the new countries which affected both emerging countries. The dispute has proved severely opposed to resolution because, at bottom, it is infused with the self-images of the two states. Pakistan deemed its identity as a Muslim homeland incomplete without Kashmir; while India sees its control over this Muslim-majority state as a demonstration of its secular identification. This tense relationship has resulted in three major wars (1947-48, 1965, 1971) and a limited one (1999) and multiple crises like the question of minorities, evacuee property, sharing of assets, division of military stores, Hyderabad and Junagarh --- the list is endless. A number of promising agreements were made. Further, the Tashkent and Shimla, agreements and Lahore declaration. Although they resolved the Indus Waters dispute in 1960 and the Rann of Kutch dispute in 1968 through negotiations, there was no agreed mechanism to guide their stable conflictual relationship. After 1971, consequent the liberation of East Pakistan and formation of Bangladesh, India gained legitimate status of being an emerging power in South Asia. In the 1980s the two sides began to talk on the Siachen, Sir Creek and the Tulbul-Wullar disputes and put in place a series of confidence building measures pertaining to conventional and nuclear weapons power. These negotiations had no set time table and were held on a need to meet basis. There was no compulsion on either side to continue their negotiations when their relationship declined in the face of terrorist attack or armed aggression. Peace and stability are pre-requisites for economic development, trade and politico-socio-cultural relations. This has assumed added urgency since South Asia has obtained nuclear capability, as there is now little margin for error. It is imperative that the security situation in South Asia is stabilised and made as resistant as possible to the

periodic shocks caused by the actions of NSAs. Avoidance of crises, prevention of conflicts and the building of mutual confidence should therefore be common objectives for the two countries.

There is a huge potential for the expansion of bilateral trade between India and Pakistan, especially now that the long-standing issue of Pakistan granting Most Favoured Nation status to India seems closer than ever to being resolved. But other issues, such as non-tariff barriers to trade, will have to be addressed before any positive move can be made towards increasing trade. There is also a long list of items on the negative list which have to be looked at before significant improvement can be achieved. The promotion of official trade will discourage smuggling and other means of illegal trade that at present cost the two countries substantial lost revenue.

The peace process launched in January 2004 had been one of the most productive and sustained in the history of a dismal bilateral relationship. This process has seen significant expansion of bilateral trade, improved people to people contact, a ceasefire on their borders, the implementation of number of confidence-building measures in disputed Kashmir, and above all serious back channel negotiation on the Kashmir question. While its policy makers have increasingly talked about the urgent need to construct a 'peaceful periphery' for many of its leader an integrated northwest region of the subcontinent was a living memory. None exemplifies this better than Prime Minister Man Mohan Singh of India, who's family lived in the north west part of what is now Pakistan and migrated to India after partition. In early 2007, speaking on India's relations with its neighbors, Singh mused on his aspirations for restoring these historic connections:

"I sincerely believe... that the destiny of the people of South Asia is interlinked. It is not just our past that links us, but our future too. India cannot be a prosperous, dynamic economy and a stable polity if our neighborhood as a whole is also not economically prosperous and politically

stable. Similarly, our neighbors cannot prosper if India does not do so as well. There are enormous opportunities for promoting mutually beneficial cooperation in South Asia. To exploit these opportunities, the nations of South Asia have to work sincerely to control the scourge of terrorism and extremism... I dream of a day, while retaining our respective national identities, one can have breakfast in Amritsar, lunch in Lahore and dinner in Kabul. That is how my forefathers lived. That is how I want to our grandchildren to live.”

Today, more than sixty five years after independence, the common people as well as the elite of India and Pakistan are concerning towards establishing condition for permanent peace. But unfortunately the situation is not so much better for India and Pakistan which it should be but the power of the old mindset is declining and the momentum for peace is growing.

Regarding the development of the nuclear policies of the two countries both have adopted a policy of minimum deterrence. Though this did not deter the two states from clashing for instance the Kargil War and nuclear race is going on but it has also been realized by both the countries that the probability of using the nuclear force against the other is little. Here it is pertinent to mention that if nuclear force is used it would be disastrous for both the countries. In the last decade of this century it was accepted that both India and Pakistan had a nuclear military capability. The nuclear tests had the following repercussion on the relations of India and Pakistan:

- India and Pakistan both started looking at each other with suspicion and mutual distrust.
- Both countries started blaming each other for real or imaginary bad conduct and the mutual co-operation came down to a very low level.
- Both the nations started spending more on the deals on defense.

The nuclear explosion of 1998 proved to the world that Pakistan's policy is reactive and dubious. The result was the Lahore Bus Diplomacy between India and Pakistan could not show any positive result as Pakistan indirectly imposed the Kargil strife on India. The whole world condemned this action of Pakistan. Though India won the strife in the ends at a very heavy cost, but the relations between the two countries became strained again. India and Pakistan have been living dangerously with their current strategies for security through an arms race since independence. Arms race has increased the threat perception towards each other and has affected adversely the development process. It is time to consider seriously the alternatives for solving the problems. It is time for transition from power politics and traditional forms of dispute resolution to national problem and to discovery of mutually beneficial options. Overt nuclear capability of these nations has highlighted the need for greater co-operation. Therefore the time has come with the advance thinking in Indo-Pak relations on the issues like security and development. They should have to arrange more and more dialogues discussions and interactions with open mind for some fruitful solutions. These measures will reduce the tensions between both the countries generated by nuclear and missile programmes. Since 2001, the two nations are moving with the global trend for peace and security. This is evident that war remained the only option for so long and none of the conflicting parties have been able to settle the issues in its favour. Therefore it is only logical and practical to try another option i.e. peace through dialogue for solving the problem.

Pakistan and India share the same and common cultural history, food, language, dress and are tied with the upheaval of the invaders and colonial powers of the past as well. There cannot be two more similar people in other areas of the world. As it was Muslims from whom the Britain took charge. Both countries blame each other for all the massacre and destruction caused at the

time of partition and do not realize that the same incidents were found on both sides. The citizens of both countries remain strongly interrelated and interconnected with each other through the similar culture, weathers, festivities and traditions which are bonding them together despite the diplomatic differences promoted by the states. The Social and cultural relationship with Pakistan is also an area which matters to concerns the emotions and belief of a common man. Similar people with common history can be the biggest enemies because the hurt of a perceived betrayal is the most. Emotion rules over the reason. Minorities of the both nations like Hindus in Pakistan and Muslims in India are still not mingled up and attached with the society in which they live. Although India is socially, politically and economically better than Pakistan and had made remarkable progress in all spheres as compared to Pakistan, but the cultural relationship in term of literature, cricket, pilgrimage and education, media, theater, cinema will surely help to improve the confidence for ties for the future.

The 1999 Lahore Memorandum of Understanding was the first Ind-Pakistan effort to come to grips with their mutual problems and to explore measures to reduce tensions in a nuclearised South Asia. Though the process was interrupted by the Kargil episode, the proposed confidence-building measures (CBMs) were taken up when the composite dialogue resumed in 2004, resulting in some significant bilateral agreements. It appears, however, that the list of CBMs agreed to at Lahore has been exhausted and currently there seems to be no discernible forward movement in the bilateral talks. It is important that negotiators think of new and innovative CBMs and establish an oversight and review mechanism to monitor the performance of past agreements, to give some impetus to the peace process. But CBMs can only be expected to provide temporary stability at best and, ultimately, the two countries' outstanding political problems, including the Kashmir dispute, will need to be resolved. The efforts at building

confidence and trust and seeking resolution of disputes can only bear fruit if the process is sustained and remains uninterrupted. On many occasions in the recent past, certain groups and individuals opposed to reconciliation between India and Pakistan have succeeded in disrupting the peace efforts. The two countries will have to resist these disruptive forces by evolving institutional mechanisms to deal with them. Past efforts were half-hearted and depended to a large extent on the character and attitudes of the individuals representing the two countries in the Joint Counter-terrorism mechanism. As the conflict in Afghanistan winds down, India and Pakistan will need to discuss their respective legitimate interests in that country. India will need to convince Pakistan that its interest in Afghanistan is not aimed at opening up a new front in the west or promote destabilisation in the two Pakistani provinces bordering Afghanistan. For its part, Pakistan will need to reassure India that it respects the legitimate and sovereign rights of India and Afghanistan to develop their bilateral relations. Due to its geographical position, Pakistan can either facilitate or block the trade between India and Afghanistan passing through its territory, but that will be entirely dependent on the state of India-Pakistan relations.

Suggestions:

The different issues which are providing as hindrance in good relations between two countries are not such, which cannot be resolved through dialogue and mutual understanding. The following measures are suggested which would help to improve cordial relations between the two countries:

- South Asia is home to one-fifth of humanity. Around 20% of world's population lives in this region with plenty of problems and issues like illiteracy, poverty, malnutrition, scarcity of water, unemployment and etc. India and Pakistan peace will help other

regional states to overcome their common, specifically, non-traditional problems and issues.

- There is much pressure from the peoples from the India and Pakistan on the two respective governments. The masses on the two sides have changed their stereotyped mindsets after the commencement of the people to people contact. The revival of diplomatic contacts and reopening of their High Commissions have played a greater role in this regard. Exchange of scholars, artists, politicians, educationists and above all common people who are visiting their relatives across the borders helped the people to overcome threat perception at public level.
- The Composite Dialogue is taking place at a correct time when the whole world is keen to have peace in South Asia. Greater influence and insistence can be felt with regard to international players, especially the USA, EU, China, Japan, Muslim bloc and Russia. South Asia appears to be a high risk conflict zone and has also become a nuclear flashpoint. While considering the necessity of regional peace in South Asia, the global powers fully endorse the settlement of Kashmir issues along with all bilateral differences between India and Pakistan.
- Confidence building measures require a continuing exercise. These measures cannot resolve all the issues but can reduce tensions and improve the regional environment greatly. India-Pakistan dialogue is therefore needed to be kept on track until the two states reach a final resolution of the issues. Existing CBMs in the military field also should be strengthened and improved effectively according to the requirement.
- Interaction between the Chambers of Commerce and Industries of both the states should be encouraged to develop, trade, commerce and industry. The trade normalization process

will increase trade opportunities for both India and Pakistan. Even though the automobile sector in Pakistan and the textile sector in India have resisted trade liberalization, there is no rationale for holding back the process which shall inevitably benefit both the countries. India and Pakistan need to work together in several areas to be able to realize the untapped trade potential. So far only incremental steps are being considered by the two governments to improve cross-border movement of goods. A comprehensive and integrated international land transport policy needs to be put in place not only to provide rail and road services connecting the two countries but also linking sea ports through land borders to enable connectivity with the rest of the world as well. India should continue to lower its non-tariff barriers as part of its ongoing reform process. In addition, a more concerted effort needs to be made to facilitate businessmen in overcoming their apprehensions about entering each other's markets and selling their products along with their country labels across the border fearlessly. The unprecedented number of exhibitions and fairs held in India and Pakistan, displaying each other's products, has been met by an overwhelming response from consumers; providing support for such efforts to continue.

- While the removal of restrictions on FDI flows has opened up new investment opportunities, businessmen from India and Pakistan are reluctant to invest due to fear of a possible disruptive political event. Investors also fear becoming easy targets for those who oppose their presence. Businessmen willing to invest could enter into joint ventures without physically locating in each other's territory, as the first step to entry, till legal systems safeguard investments and there is improvement in investors' confidence. For a liberal visa regime to be in place, electronic 'smart systems' should be used to screen visa

applications and track physical movement of people, while avoiding undue harassment to genuine traders. Telecommunication channels also need to be opened up to foster people-to-people contact and reduce business costs. The existing communication system between India and Pakistan does not permit travelers to use their mobile phones in the other's country. Buying local SIM (Subscriber Identity Module) cards too is not an easy option, involving a lot of paper work for those travelling. As a result, visitors and businessmen have developed informal mechanisms of procuring local SIM-cards through friends and relatives. The issue of improving telecommunication between the two countries was raised in the 7th round of talks and is expected to be a part of the trade normalization process.

- India and Pakistan need to constantly engage with one another to understand each other's regulatory regimes. As new businessmen enter into trading relations, it is important to have forums that bring buyers and sellers together. Guaranteed payments are essential for building new and lasting business partnerships, for which banking channels would need to be improved. An innovative dispute resolution system should also be put in place. For many years, Dubai has provided as a facilitator for trade and guaranteed payments between India and Pakistan. Thus, a third country wherein India and Pakistan share mutual trust could provide for an effective dispute resolution mechanism. Moreover, it is important for the business communities to create multilevel channels of communication which can reduce misconceptions, bridge information gaps, and generate a significant change in the business environment of the two countries. All such holistic measures could help in realizing the untapped trade potential between India and Pakistan.

- Agro- Climatic conditions being same in both the countries, possibilities for agriculture co-operation should be explored and enhanced. It will help in attaining food self sufficiency and earning revenue from the other countries.
- The media can bring the people close and create harmony between two nations. The media of both countries can play an effective role by objectively presenting the news and Pakistan and India should start educational ties and offer scholarships for the students of each country and should invite the scholars to come and visit each other and do researches on common interests.
- The literature and syllabus books should not contain hatred to each other and both governments should revise and rewrite the history without depicting hostility to each other.
- There should be cultural exchange programs between India and Pakistan. The artists programs and films and there should be know the Indian Cultural traditions and values.
- Pakistan should invite and take help from the film makers and singers of India to boost its film industry. There should be inter-cultural dialogue between the activists, students, writers, scholars, historians to promote peace and harmony between two nations.
- Cricket should be used to create congenial atmosphere between people of two nations and the leadership should show respect and tolerance towards the defeated side of the country to promote peace in the region.
- Intelligence agencies of both the nations should not blame each other for their internal disturbances. Transparency on defense policy issues and equipments is required to create cordial atmosphere in both the countries. Initially it could be done simply by providing the information about the military affairs, such as equipment holding and weapon

acquisitions after the event. The possibilities of collective non military activities between military personal in both the nations should be explored.

- People of both countries are always enthusiastic to visit the territory of each other so both countries should offer attractive incentives from tourism point of view. It will help in developing harmonious relations on the one hand in both nations and on the other hand it will give boost to the revenue for these two states.
- Simplification in the procedure for granting for granting visa is required on priority basis. Visitors coming from both the countries help in developing the atmosphere for peace and fairs and Festivals should be organized collectively by both the states to spread the message of harmony, peace and mutual trust and faith.

Last but not least, Joint ventures between the two countries are non- existent, and so is direct investment. While India and Pakistan compete to sell their goods in the global market, there are many areas of enterprise in which both the countries can complement each other's needs and hence produce cost- effective, quality goods. Potential sectors for joint ventures include agricultural products, tires, auto spare parts, minerals, chemicals, pharmaceuticals, leather, textile and telecommunications, education and literature sector, media, theatre, cinema, sports, and many others. The exchange of technology and skills between the two neighbors will help enhance the quality of their goods at comparatively cheaper prices. Telecommunication networking between them will help closer interaction between the elite as well as common people. Also joint project to provide IT related services for world markets would be an attractive proposition for global companies. Free intra country tourism will ensure people to people contact. Also, joint tourism projects, especially in the Himalayan region could provide a fillip to

the tourism industry in both the countries. India and Pakistan can establish joint ventures to harness and transmit the region's hydropower resources. Cooperation in water management and hydropower projects can help in increasing irrigation benefits, decreasing risks of floods, and establishing Indo-Pakistan electric grid system for intra-country transmission of electricity.

Therefore it can be said that Wars did not resolve any issue in the past. We believed that Kashmir can become the bridge to peace between the two countries, which has so far been the primary cause of hostility between India and Pakistan. The collaboration of civil and military spheres for peace gained legitimacy, needless to say this kind of synergy is only the beginning and needs to be consolidated and further strengthened through a combination of initiatives in the years ahead. Despite all, It was convinced that we were on the wrong track as far as neighborhood management was concerned. We needed a new approach to convert the traditional confrontation and conflict approach to one of cooperation and convergence. People in South Asia, home to a vast majority of the world's poor, need the availability of employment opportunities more than anything else. This is essential so that no one takes interest in destructive activities like terrorism. If there is cooperation between India and Pakistan and not conflict, vast opportunities will open up for trade, travel and development that will create prosperity in both nations.