

CHAPTER-II

REVIEW OF LITERATURE ON SAADAT HASAN MANTO'S SHORT STORIES

“Saadat Hasan Manto was a true painter of the characters what he experienced in the society” (Ratan 15). Manto opened and exposed the hidden truth behind the morality what people used to hide under ‘white-collar’. Manto lived very short span of life just about of 43 years. He was born on May 11, 1912 and died on January 18, 1955. The small place near Ludhiana called Smarala is known by his birth place and Lahore in Pakistan is equally famous among Manto’s fans for as his death place. His name and stature in the writing world can be felt for his masterly crafted 22 books on short stories, and he also wrote 6 plays for radio and his personal life incidents that he recorded in his 2 sketches. “Manto started his life translating Gorky, Chekov, Oscar Wilde and Hugo as a writer” (Asaduddin 159). He was just 19 year old when he wrote a story named *Tamasha* on the massacre of Jallianwala Bagh. “Manto is not only known for his great works of short stories but he was also named as rebel” (Dutt 43). Manto means ‘weight’ in Kashmiri language and his parents came from Kashmir and settled in Lahore. Manto was rebel because he became voice of the voiceless people and he exposed the reality and truth behind the man-woman relationship in his stories. “He had to face trial six times for the obscenity in the stories in India and Pakistan”. (Dutt 12)

In this study, 22 stories have been taken for the analysis on the basis of available translated works available in Hindi and in English. The major text as source language titled as ‘Manto ki amar kahaniyan’ published by Maruti Prakashan Meerut and will be termed as SLT (Source Language Text) onwards. Many English Translations on Manto have been attempted in India and abroad. ‘Bitter Fruit The

Very Best of Saadat Hasan Manto edited and translated by Khalid Hasan' here onwards it is termed as TLT I (Target Language Text First) , 'Bombay Stories ' translated by Matt Reeck and Aftab Ahmad , it will be termed as TLT II (Target Language Text Second) here onwards have been taken for the study. There are 51 stories translated in English in TLT I and there are 14 stories translated in English in TLT II. Though, Manto has been translated widely in English but the works on the related issue that is to be discussed in the present study has not been attempted by scholars. The critical work on the translated works on Manto is not available much.

Narang (2004) in his article titled "Manto Reconsidered" highlights the symphony , tone of sorrow , '*dukha*' , frailty and the symbols of blood and flesh have been discussed at length. "the sorrow of existence, the loneliness of the soul, and that unfathomable sufferings" (Narang 12). The justification of style in the translated work fumbles on these aspects where emotional break downs are the connecting phrases in the source language (SL).

Yusin (2011) wrote about the plight of partition in her article and stated through the lunatic characters, Toba Tek Singh is one of the masterpieces of Manto that speaks much about the conditions of the people who suffered badly during partition of India in 1947. "Toba Tek Singh opens with the Indian and Pakistani governments agreeing, two or three years after the Partition" (27). The terms which have been used by Manto were really untranslatable at many phases. "So Bole So Nihal" , "Gur-gur tey" and muttering sounds what a lunatic speaks that all seem unfit in the TL. She found the fact about the ambiguity that prevails throughout the story. This ambiguity what she discussed has become a hurdle for the translator to migrate the essence of characterization in the TL. These lapses cannot be treated as essential loss. The beautiful thing what Manto presented is about the ambiguity on

the names. As it is not clear in the text about the Toba Tek Singh whether it is a name of Bishan Singh or it is a name of the place. This has become a case of ontological argument that lies between geographical and lexical boundaries. This helplessness can easily be found in the translated version of Manto in English. “uper they gur gur the annex bay dhayan they moong” (Khalid 13). Khalid shows his helplessness to translate Manto as it is in TL. The poignant moments during the course of story could not be translated. Mi’yar is remembered as one of the early scholars on Manto who started highlighting the inner strengths of the stories as “Manto’s creative vision has become expansive enough to transform the individual and the particular into general and the universal” (Memon 26).

Social life’s portrayal has been key concepts of Manto in his writings. According to Shaheen & Qadeer (2012), Manto was a master in three things – Realism, Spontaneity and in originality in expression. Realism like using real names, real places, and attributes of characters with their respective dresses make Manto a realistic author. His writings have been highly influenced by French and Russian writers. Spontaneity in the development of the content in the story has been a masterly technique of Manto that can easily be seen in his long narrative environment during the development of plot. Because of his originality in the characters, he was accused for obscenity. He was not intended to write on nudity but it was his originality. The seven stories marked as a symbol of nudity and obscenity in the society. The goal of translator seems defeated on this aspect. Translators fail in finding equivalences of Manto’s stories in TL. “Eliminating details that contribute to the texture of the narrative has resulted in inaccuracies” (Asaduddin 167) .

Hashimi & Aftab (2013) discuss about the psychiatric elements seen in the study of Manto. Restlessness, uneasiness and other psychological disorders led him

to the alcoholism. These lunatic behaviors have been witnessed in the characters of the stories. Reading Manto's stories from his points of view leaves reader to think about his psychological aspect. "Manto was plagued by a constant restlessness and unease in life" (Hashimi et al 1096). Translating a complete content from the psychological level to the text level in the TL is a tough exercise for a translator at cognitive level. 'Death Drive' that is a psychological term that defines as self destructive steps that lead to death. This behavior of his own personality can easily be found in his works titled "letters to the Uncle Sam". Self-destruction has been one of the main constituents of Manto's writings that can also be felt in his characters of stories. Untranslatability at this level becomes essential, since the effect is so deeply inserted that cannot be translated easily. As "Thanda Gosht" by Manto has been translated as "Colder than Ice" by Khalid Hasan creates a huge gap between contents of two texts.

Reeck (2014) points out the social issue related to the conditions of women in the stories of Manto. " Manto's prostitutes demonstrate few of the horrors that a moralistic reading anticipates" (Reeck 1). Position of women in the stories speaks badly about the conditions women used to live. Translating style into TL is one of the main challenges for a translator. In the discussion of a style, that the most important thing is about the real "real of thought" what an original writer wants to express. The receiving of the idea by the reader is connecting bridge between an author and its style. Here only two people are involved in the reading of original text. Once it is translated into any TL, the involvement increases. This involvement is directly proportional to understand the originality of a style of a writer to the reader. Translation doesn't leave many choices for a reader to understand the style of a writer in original. Reeck tries to understand Manto through the lenses of a

comparison between Urdu language and English language that creates a gap in style itself. In his paper, he highlights the main thrust area of Manto that is women in his stories. Reeck discusses about the style of original Manto. He divided the characters into class with symbolic values. These values can be felt through the reading of woman characters in the stories. For example the typical symbolic value related to the prostitute is that she believes in God and starts her 'flesh' business with the prayer of Almighty. This stylistic feature is a compulsive nature of Manto and it seems a challenge for a translator to migrate style into TL.

Khanna (2014) also argues on the existence of women and her experience during the partition through the reading of Manto. She highlights the plight of womanhood through the metaphorical words like silence and survival. This feature of Manto is widely discussed by the scholars. 'Khol Do' is a story of rape victim. She was brutally raped by people around. There are two psychological traumas related to the rape victim what he narrated that can make Manto a real 'social-psychologist'. He discussed about the post-traumatic effect on rape victim through her character named Sakina. This environment what he created is not so easy to translate. The variations in style in terms of lexical, phonological, monism, dualism and fiction & sense are important factors that need extra care for translating writer like Manto.

Arif Nisar (2014) discusses about the problems related to the cartography. It is crafting or designing a story on the verge of lines that divides India and Pakistan. On translating major issues in the stories of Manto related India-Pakistan creates a gap on cartographic level. In *Tetwal ka Kutta*, Manto suspected tension between India and Pakistan during partition. He penned down the grim realities. "True Manto had no patience with the hypocrisy of his time" (Nisar 9730). The Manto's

experience penetrates into the mind of reader on the level of its lexical beauty. On the basis of lexical analysis, construction in sentences, words of monosyllabic, words of disyllabic, trisyllabic, multisyllabic and to the compound words are the parts of this lexical analysis. The construction of stories encompasses the conditions of partition of that time with the grave problems what people suffered badly. The use of sentences with satirical notch makes reader heavier on his cognitive level. Thus, the sense at the levels of text and at the cognitive makes Manto, a realistic in approach. Translator struggles at this level to justify Manto, writer of two nations.

Sarika Chhetry (2015) discussed in her research paper about three stories of Manto with the core concept of madness and the element of nationalism involved. Madness has been essential in defining the theatrical aspect of the texts. In the stories like Toba Tek Singh, Khol Do and Thandaa Goshht symbolize an eccentric madness among texts and characters. The way Manto adopted to generate madness is beyond description. What a translator struggles on these issues are really a matter of discussion on stylistic levels. Stylistic analysis becomes essential and matter of discussion naturally in translation studies. The key concepts related to the Stylistics are conversion, affixation, collocation, deviated words, split word, prolonged and half finished words and elision are the valuable stylistic devices that need a proper attention in Translation Studies.

Amrita Basu (2015) touches very sensitive issue in the study of Manto that the dealing of subversive romantic incidents with special reference of story *Boo*. The comparison of two women on the basis of the odor of their bodies speaks much about the character of Manto. Kumar (2015) discusses about the comparison of two different translators in his research paper. The special reference of the story *Boo* has been taken for the analysis. In this paper, it has been proved that two translators

completely represent a different version of same words used by the original writer. Further discussion has been on the stylistics displaced in the translations on the syntactical level. Sentences in length, long & short sentences forms of sentences and the way of words arranged by the translators have been discussed by Kumar in his paper. Since, in the translation of Manto, omission has become compulsive because of the use of local words in his stories. A large number of chunk has been missed by the translators of Manto in English. “in Naya Qanoon , the story of about 3,500 words, the total omission amounts 500 words.”(Asaduddin 164).

English Translation of Manto’s Short Stories

Bitter Fruit the Very Best of Saadat Hasan Manto edited and translated by Khalid Hasan (onwards written as **TLT I**), Bombay Stories translated by Matt Reeck and Aftab Ahmad (onwards written as **TLT II**), Life and works Saadat Hasan Manto edited by Alok Bhalla Naked Voices stories and sketches translated by Rakshanda Jalil, , Why I write Essays by Saadat Hasan Manto edited & translated by Aakar Patel and Star from Another Sky Khalid Hasan have been taken as main sources of stylistic analysis in this study and articles published in various national and international journals.

English Translations of Manto by Khalid Hasan

The voluminous work on the translation of Manto in English has been attempted by Khalid Hasan published in 2008 by Penguin Books India. Khalid has divided his works into six categories. He translated 51 short stories, one drama titled In This Vortex , 32 sketches , 15 portraits , one letter titled as letter to the Sam uncle and in his last chapter termed as Manto on Manto that consists of 4 translations respectively. His works is of in 704 pages that is one of the voluminous translations available on Manto in English. It is one of the reasons that he is being criticized by

scholars of translation. He was critically reviewed by the scholars and received guidelines and instructions from translators. "Translation may be considered as the reincarnation of a writer in a different language and culture; a bad and irresponsible translator can do great to a writer, falsifying his image and distorting the true import and spirit of his work." (Asaduddin 160). Translating an author is just to incarnate him into new form. In this process, no lapses are tolerated by the aware readers of both the languages. According to Ghosh "Khalid just completes an act of recreation of new text" (34). It means Khalid fails to transform Manto as it is in translated work. The degree of criticism what Khalid received on his work is intensively sharp. He failed at many fronts to fulfill the criteria to be a good translator. He has not only changed the titles of the stories which he translated but he missed the maximum numbers in the target language. According to Asaduddin "in Naya Qanoon, a story of 3500 words, the total omission amounts to about 500 words" (164). Khalid Hasan missed many important issues in the translated work, one of them is connectivity with the reader. Manto was a master in the development of characters like Anton Chekov. "He was highly influenced by Chekov and Gorki" (Dutt 23). 23. And this feature in the translated work has been violated by Khalid. By the omission of larger chunk in the TL speaks about the losing connectivity in the development of a character what was a soul of the original story. "Hasan omits the place-name Byculla Station which gives the setting certain solidity, providing it, as it were. "a local habitation and a name." (Asaduddin 167). The most important things in the process of translation are to consider the emotions of SL, Syntactic Structure, Language used in the SL, message to be conveyed, and socio-economic cultural based values highlighted in the SL. The Textual part, idioms and phrases, rhetoric, central idea, equivalences and the literary devices are the most difficult work to

transmigrate as it is in the TL. So far Khalid's translation is concerned, he seems unfit as a good translator what Asaduddin observes "Needless to say, Khalid Hasan overshoots his brief as a translator who should resolutely resist the temptation to 'improve upon' the original writer" (Asadudin 170). It is observed that the purpose of translation was just to introduce Manto to the reader of English Language.

Translation of Manto by Matt Reeck and Aftab Ahmad

The fact about this translation is that it is equally suffered from the same kind of losses as happened with TLTI. There are 14 short stories which have been translated by Reeck & Ahmad. The book titled as "Bombay Stories" was published by Random House India in 2012. The utmost care has been taken by the translators and the appendices have also been included. This feature is missing in the TLTI. This work can be said better than TLTI because of its limited numbers of translations of Short Stories of Manto. The availability of review work is almost feeble to discuss here as an authentic source. There are few newspapers reviews are available on this book. Much work has been done on Khalid Hasan's translations, so a vacuum can easily be felt in the critical work of TLTII. In TLTII, the first 40 pages have been written for the introduction of Manto as a writer. Some pitfalls have been filled in TLTII by the translators—Reeck and Ahmad which have been left by Khalid in TLTI. The very first is the numbers of short stories translated in TLTII are fewer than TLTI. Asaduddin points out and criticizes the translation of Khalid on the change of the titles speaks it as "unimaginative change" (163). This change in the titles can easily be not discussed in TLTII. Translators of TLTII have taken care while translating titles of the stories. *Khuhiyaan*, *Siraj*, *Mozellee* and *Mummy* are the exemplary titles. Ahmad can be considered as a good translator since he is recipient of PEN translator grant that is one of the renowned awards in the field of

Translation Studies. In spite of his scholarly background, he couldn't escape himself from the losses what he experienced in his translations.

Translation of Manto by Rakhshanda Jalil

Rakhshanda Jalil (2008) has also successfully attempted translation of Manto in English. She compiled her book titled *Naked Voices Stories & Sketches*. There are 16 stories and 3 sketches of Manto which have been translated by her. She wonderfully translated those stories which have not been attempted before by Khalid Hasan, Matt Reeck and Ahmad. She admitted herself in the introductory note about the popularity of famous stories of Manto like Toba Tek Singh and Boo and hence she left them intentionally in her work of translation. It is proved by her writings that her research on Manto added new chapter in the works of translation. She is only writer among above cited translators who introduced Manto at length. She defined the meaning of Manto as "weight" (Jalil viii).

Thus, all the relevant and available literary works, articles and views given by scholars of repute have been read and discussed that show a critical appraisal of stories of Manto in different perspectives. The discussion has focused on the scholarly aptitude of Manto and his impact on the modern researchers. There are only few books available on the translations of Manto's stories in English Language. Here in the study, the most popular works on translation have been chosen for analyzing translation. It is observed and also given views of scholar like M. Asaduddin on the translation of Khalid Hasan. He sharply reacted and criticized Hasan's works with authenticated facts written in his research article. M.Asaduddin

has opened a new debate that how to deal translation in a perfect way. The study will examine the works on Manto's translation by Khalid Hasan and Matt Reeck & Aftab Ahmad. Loss and Gain is an inevitable phenomenon in the process of translation.

Works Cited

- Asaduddin, M. "Manto in English: An Assessment of Khalid Hasan's Translations." *Life and Works of Saadat Hasan Manto*. Ed. Alok Bhalla. Shimla: Indian Institute of Advanced Study, 2004.159-71. Print.
- Basu, Amrita. "Subversion of Romance in Saadat Hasan Manto's *Bu*." *Contemporary Literary Review India* 2.2 (2015) : 1-7. [Http://www.literaryjournal.in/index.php](http://www.literaryjournal.in/index.php).Web. 7 Sept. 2016.
- Chhetry , Sarika. "Nationalism and Madness: A Study of Saadat Hasan Manto's stories "Toba Tek Singh", "Thanda Gosht" and "Khol Do"." *Lapis Lazuli An international Literary Journal* 5.1 (2015): 300-9. [Http:// www.pintersociety.com](http://www.pintersociety.com). Web.6 Sept. 2016.
- Ghosh , R. *Translation & Marginalized Writer*. New Delhi: Aakash Publications, 2015. Print.
- Khanna, Tanvi. "Silence, Survival and Recuperation: Reading Women's Experiences in Partition Literature." *Research Journal of English Language and Literature (RJELAL)* 2.3 (2014): 19-25.[Http:// www.rjelal.com](http://www.rjelal.com).Web. 14 July 2016.
- Kumar, Ravinder. "Stylistic Analysis of Two Different Translations of Manto's Short Story "Boo"." *Literary Quest* 1.9 (2015): 1-8. Web.1 March 2015.
- M. Hashmi, Ali, and Muhammad Awais Aftab. "The Touch of Madness: Manto as a Psychiatric Case Study." *Pakistan Journal of Medical Sciences* 29.5 (2013): 1094–1098. Print.
- Manto, Saadat Hasan. *Bitter Fruit The Very Best of Saadat Hasan Manto*. Ed. And Trans. Khalid Hasan. Noida: Penguin Books India, 2008. Print.

- . "Dastavez." Ed. And Trans. Sharad Dutt. *Saadat Hasan Manto : Dastavez*. New Delhi: Raj Kamal , 1993. Print.
- . *Naked Voices Stories & Sketches*. Trans. Rakhshanda Jalil: Roli Books Pvt. Ltd., 2008. Print.
- . *Saadat Hasan Manto Bombay Short Stories*. Trans. Matt Reeck and Aftab Ahmad. Noida: Random House Publishers India, 2012. Print.
- . *The Best of Manto. A Collection of His Short Stories*. Ed. And Trans. Jai Ratan. New Delhi: Sterling Publishers, 1989. Print.
- Memon, Muhammad Umar. "Melodrama or ...? A Note on Manto's "In This Maelstrom." *Life and Works of Saadat Hasan Manto*. Ed. Alok Bhalla. Shimla: Indian Institute of Advanced Study, 2004.13-27. Print.
- Nisar, Arif. "Problematic of Cartography: A Critical Study of Select Stories of Manto." *European Academic Research* II.7 (2014) : 9725-33. [Http://www.euacademic.org](http://www.euacademic.org). Web. 4 Aug. 2016.
- Shaheen, Aqeela and Riaz Qadeer. "The Influence of Manto and Maupassant on Social Life." *Pak. J. Commer. Soc. Sci.* 6. 2 (2012) : 222-229. [Http://www.jespk.net/publications/86.pdf](http://www.jespk.net/publications/86.pdf). Web. 19 June. 2015.
- Yusin, Jennifer. "Beyond Nationalism: The border, trauma and Partition fiction." *Thesis Eleven* 105. I (2011): 23-34. [Http://journals.sagepub.com](http://journals.sagepub.com). Web. 20 Sept. 2016.